# OSCILLATORY PROPERTIES OF CERTAIN NONLINEAR FRACTIONAL NABLA DIFFERENCE EQUATIONS 

Weinian $\mathrm{Li}^{1, \dagger}$, Weihong Sheng ${ }^{1}$ and Pingping Zhang ${ }^{1}$


#### Abstract

In this paper, we investigate the oscillation of a class of nonlinear fractional nabla difference equations. Some oscillation criteria are established.


Keywords Oscillation, nonlinear fractional nabla difference equation, RiemannLiouville fractional nabla difference operator.

MSC(2010) 26A33, 39A12, 39A21.

## 1. Introduction

As we know, the theory of fractional differential equations and their applications have been investigated extensively in the past few years. For example, see the literatures [6,14-17,23-28] and the references therein. In 1980s, Miller and Ross [21] and Gray and Zhang [11] firstly introduced the definitions of non-integer order differences and sums, which were the origination of the theory of discrete fractional calculus. After then, several authors had a strong interest in studying the theory of fractional difference equations. A lot of excellent results have been established. For example, we refer the readers to $[1-5,7-10,12,13,18-20,22]$ and the references therein.

The oscillation theory is a very important part of the qualitative theory of fractional difference equations. However, to the best of authors' knowledge, up to now, very little is known regarding the oscillatory behavior of fractional difference equations [ $7,8,18-20,22]$.

In this paper, we investigate the oscillation of fractional nabla difference equations of the form

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right)+q(t) f(x(t))=g(t), \quad t \in \mathbb{N}_{a}  \tag{1.1}\\
\left.\nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(t)\right|_{t=a}=c
\end{array}\right.
$$

where $\nabla f(t)=f(t)-f(t-1), c$ and $\alpha$ are constants, $0<\alpha<1, \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x$ is the Riemann-Liouville fractional nabla difference operator of order $\alpha$ of $x, a \geq 0$ is a real number, and $\mathbb{N}_{a}=\{a, a+1, a+2, \cdots\}$.

Throughout this paper, we always assume that
(A) $f: \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, and $x f(x)>0$ for $x \neq 0, g: \mathbb{N}_{a} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$, and $q(t) \geq 0, t \in \mathbb{N}_{a}$.

[^0]A solution $x(t)$ of the Eq. (1.1) is said to be oscillatory if it is neither eventually positive nor eventually negative, otherwise it is nonoscillatory.

The paper is organized as follows. In Section 2, we present some basic definitions and lemmas in order to prove our main results. In Section 3, we establish some results for the oscillation of the Eq. (1.1). In Section 4, we construct some examples to show that the assumptions of our main results can not be dropped.

## 2. Preliminaries

In this section, we collect some basic definitions and lemmas that will be important to us in what follows. These and other related results and their proofs can be found in $[1,3,13]$.

Definition 2.1. Let $\nu>0$. The $\nu$-th fractional sum $f$ is defined by

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a}^{-\nu} f(t)=\frac{1}{\Gamma(\nu)} \sum_{s=a}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\nu-1}} f(s) \tag{2.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

for $t \in \mathbb{N}_{a}$, where $\Gamma$ is the gamma function, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
t^{\bar{\nu}}=\frac{\Gamma(t+\nu)}{\Gamma(t)} \tag{2.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Definition 2.2. Let $\mu>0$ and $m-1<\mu<m$, where $m$ denotes a positive integer. Set $\nu=m-\mu$. The $\mu$-th fractional nabla difference is defined as

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a}^{\mu} f(t)=\nabla_{a}^{m-\nu} f(t)=\nabla_{a}^{m} \nabla_{a}^{-\nu} f(t) \tag{2.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

Lemma 2.1. Let $f$ be a real-valued function defined on $\mathbb{N}_{a}$, and let $\mu, \nu>0$. Then

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a}^{-\nu}\left[\nabla_{a}^{-\mu} f(t)\right]=\nabla_{a}^{-(\mu+\nu)} f(t)=\nabla_{a}^{-\mu}\left[\nabla_{a}^{-\nu} f(t)\right] \tag{2.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a+1}^{-\nu} \nabla f(t)=\nabla \nabla_{a}^{-\nu} f(t)-\frac{(t-a+1)^{\overline{\nu-1}}}{\Gamma(\nu)} f(a) \tag{2.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

Lemma 2.2. For every $t \in \mathbb{N}_{a}$,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a}^{-\nu}(t-a+1)^{\bar{\mu}}=\frac{\Gamma(\mu+1)}{\Gamma(\mu+\nu+1)}(t-a+1)^{\overline{\nu+\mu}} \tag{2.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Lemma 2.3. Let

$$
\begin{equation*}
E(t)=\sum_{s=a}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\alpha}} x(s), t \in \mathbb{N}_{a} \tag{2.7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Then

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla E(t)=\Gamma(1-\alpha) \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t) \tag{2.8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. Using Definition 2.1, it follows from (2.7) that

$$
\begin{align*}
E(t) & =\sum_{s=a}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\alpha}} x(s)=\sum_{s=a}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{(1-\alpha)-1}} x(s)  \tag{2.9}\\
& =\Gamma(1-\alpha) \nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(t) .
\end{align*}
$$

Using Definition 2.2, it follows from (2.9) that

$$
\nabla E(t)=\Gamma(1-\alpha) \nabla \nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(t)=\Gamma(1-\alpha) \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)
$$

The proof of Lemma 2.3 is complete.

## 3. Main results

In this section, we establish the oscillation results of Eq. (1.1). First, we give two lemmas.

Lemma 3.1. If $x(t)>0$ is a solution of the Eq. (1.1), then $x(t)$ satisfies the difference inequality

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right) \leq g(t), t \in \mathbb{N}_{a} \tag{3.1}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. Noting the assumption (A), from the Eq. (1.1), we have

$$
\nabla\left(\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right)=-q(t) f(x(t))+g(t) \leq g(t)
$$

which shows $x(t)>0$ is a solution of the inequality (3.1). The proof is complete.
Similarly we have the following lemma.
Lemma 3.2. If $x(t)<0$ is a solution of the Eq. (1.1), then $x(t)$ satisfies the difference inequality

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right) \geq g(t), t \in \mathbb{N}_{a} \tag{3.2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Next, we introduce our main results. By Lemma 3.1 and Lemma 3.2, we immediately obtain the following conclusion.

Theorem 3.1. If the inequality (3.1) has no eventually positive solutions and the inequality (3.2) has no eventually negative solutions, then every solution $x(t)$ of the Eq. (1.1) is oscillatory.

Theorem 3.2. Assume that $x(t)$ is a solution of Eq. (1.1) and there exists $t_{0} \in \mathbb{N}_{a}$ such that $\left.\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right|_{t=t_{0}}=C$ exists. If

$$
\begin{equation*}
\liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right]\right\}=-\infty \tag{3.3}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\limsup _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right]\right\}=+\infty \tag{3.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

then the solution $x(t)$ of the Eq. (1.1) is oscillatory.
Proof. Suppose to the contrary that the solution $x(t)$ is a non-oscillatory solution of Eq. (1.1). Then $x(t)$ is eventually positive or eventually negative.

If $x(t)>0, t \geq t_{0}$, by Lemma 3.1, we obtain

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right) \leq g(t), t \in \mathbb{N}_{t_{0}} \tag{3.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

Summing both sides of (3.5) from $t_{0}+1$ to $t$, we obtain

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t) \leq \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x\left(t_{0}\right)+\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t} g(s)=C+\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t} g(s) . \tag{3.6}
\end{equation*}
$$

Applying the $\nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha}$ operator to the above inequality (3.6), we have

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha} \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t) \leq \nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha}\left[C+\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t} g(s)\right] \tag{3.7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Using Definition 2.2, Lemma 2.1 in the left-hand side of (3.7) and noting the initial condition of Eq. (1.1), we obtain

$$
\begin{align*}
\nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha} \nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t) & =\nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha} \nabla \nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(t) \\
& =\nabla \nabla_{a}^{-\alpha} \nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(t)-\frac{(t-a+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \nabla_{a}^{-(1-\alpha)} x(a)  \tag{3.8}\\
& =x(t)-\frac{c}{\Gamma(\alpha)}(t-a+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}
\end{align*}
$$

Using Definition 2.1, it follows from the right-hand side of (3.7) that

$$
\begin{align*}
& \nabla_{a+1}^{-\alpha}\left[C+\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t} g(s)\right] \\
= & \frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right] . \tag{3.9}
\end{align*}
$$

Combining (3.7)-(3.9), we have

$$
\begin{align*}
x(t) \leq & \frac{c}{\Gamma(\alpha)}(t-a+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}} \\
& +\frac{1}{\Gamma(\alpha)} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right] \tag{3.10}
\end{align*}
$$

It follows from (3.10) that

$$
\begin{align*}
& \Gamma(\alpha)(t-a)^{1-\alpha} x(t) \\
\leq & c(t-a+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}(t-a)^{1-\alpha}  \tag{3.11}\\
& +(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right] .
\end{align*}
$$

By using the Stirling's formula [7]

$$
\lim _{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\Gamma(t) t^{\varepsilon}}{\Gamma(t+\varepsilon)}=1, \varepsilon>0
$$

we obtain

$$
\begin{align*}
& \lim _{t \rightarrow \infty}(t-a)^{1-\alpha}(t-a+1)^{\alpha-1} \\
= & \lim _{t \rightarrow \infty}(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \frac{\Gamma(t-a+1+\alpha-1)}{\Gamma(t-a+1)} \\
= & \lim _{t \rightarrow \infty}(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \frac{\Gamma(t-a+\alpha)}{(t-a) \Gamma(t-a)}  \tag{3.12}\\
= & \lim _{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{\Gamma(t-a+\alpha)}{(t-a)^{\alpha} \Gamma(t-a)} \\
= & 1 .
\end{align*}
$$

Noting (3.12) and taking $t \rightarrow \infty$ in (3.11), we have

$$
\liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-a)^{1-\alpha} x(t)\right\} \leq-\infty
$$

which contradicts with $x(t)>0$.
If $x(t)<0, t \geq t_{0}$, by Lemma 3.2, using the above mentioned method, we easily obtain a contradiction. This completes the proof of Theorem 3.2.

Theorem 3.3. Assume that $x(t)$ is a solution of Eq. (1.1) and there exists $t_{0} \in \mathbb{N}_{a}$ such that $\left.\nabla_{a}^{\alpha} x(t)\right|_{t=t_{0}}=C$ exists. If

$$
\begin{equation*}
\liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left(1-\frac{s-1}{t}\right) g(s)\right\}=-\infty \tag{3.13}
\end{equation*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{equation*}
\limsup _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left(1-\frac{s-1}{t}\right) g(s)\right\}=+\infty \tag{3.14}
\end{equation*}
$$

then the solution $x(t)$ of the Eq. (1.1) is oscillatory.
Proof. Suppose to the contrary that there is a non-oscillatory solution $x(t)$. Then $x(t)$ is eventually positive or eventually negative.

If $x(t)>0, t \geq t_{0}$. As in the proof of Theorem 3.2, we obtain (3.6). Using Lemma 2.3, it follows from (3.6) that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla E(t) \leq \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left[C+\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t} g(s)\right] \tag{3.15}
\end{equation*}
$$

Summing both sides of (3.15) from $t_{0}+1$ to $t$, we have

$$
\begin{align*}
E(t) & \leq E\left(t_{0}\right)+\Gamma(1-\alpha) \sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right]  \tag{3.16}\\
& =E\left(t_{0}\right)+C \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left(t-t_{0}\right)+\Gamma(1-\alpha) \sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}(t-s+1) g(s)
\end{align*}
$$

Therefore,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\frac{E(t)}{t} \leq \frac{E\left(t_{0}\right)}{t}+C \Gamma(1-\alpha)\left(1-\frac{t_{0}}{t}\right)+\Gamma(1-\alpha) \sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left(1-\frac{s-1}{t}\right) g(s) \tag{3.17}
\end{equation*}
$$

Letting $t \rightarrow \infty$ in (3.17) and noting the assumption (3.13), we obtain

$$
\liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty} \frac{E(t)}{t}=-\infty
$$

which contradicts with $E(t)>0$.
If $x(t)<0, t \geq t_{0}$, Noting the condition (3.14) and using the above mentioned method, we easily obtain a contradiction. The proof of Theorem 3.3 is complete.

## 4. Examples

In this section, we introduce some examples to illustrate our main results.
Example 4.1. Consider the following fractional nabla difference equation

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right)+\frac{\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right) \Gamma(t)}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{2}\right)} x(t)=\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right), t \in \mathbb{N}_{1}  \tag{4.1}\\
\left.\nabla_{1}^{-\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right|_{t=1}=\frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2}
\end{array}\right.
$$

Here $\alpha=\frac{1}{2}, q(t)=\frac{\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right) \Gamma(t)}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{2}\right)}, f(x(t))=x(t), g(t)=\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right)$. By careful calculation, we find that $x(t)=t^{\frac{\overline{1}}{2}}>0$ is a non-oscillatory solution of Eq. (4.1).

In fact, using Lemma 2.2, we have

$$
\begin{align*}
\nabla_{1}^{-\frac{1}{2}} x(t) & =\nabla_{1}^{-\frac{1}{2}} t^{\frac{1}{2}}=\frac{\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{2}+1\right)}{\Gamma\left(\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}+1\right)} t^{\overline{\frac{1}{2}+\frac{1}{2}}}  \tag{4.2}\\
& =\frac{\frac{1}{2} \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{2}\right)}{\Gamma(2)} t^{\overline{1}}=\frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2} t
\end{align*}
$$

By Definition 2.2, we obtain

$$
\begin{align*}
\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t) & =\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} t^{\frac{1}{2}}=\nabla_{1} \nabla_{1}^{-\frac{1}{2}} t^{\frac{1}{2}} \\
& =\nabla_{1}\left(\frac{1}{2} \sqrt{\pi} t\right)=\frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2} \tag{4.3}
\end{align*}
$$

Therefore,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right)=\nabla\left(\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} t^{\frac{1}{2}}\right)=0 \tag{4.4}
\end{equation*}
$$

Using the relation (2.2) of Definition 2.1, we obtain

$$
\begin{equation*}
x(t)=t^{\frac{\overline{1}}{2}}=\frac{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{2}\right)}{\Gamma(t)} \tag{4.5}
\end{equation*}
$$

Combining (4.2)-(4.5), we conclude that $x(t)=t^{\frac{1}{2}}$ is a solution of Eq. (4.1).
For the solution $x(t)=t^{\frac{1}{2}}$ of Eq. (4.1), it is easy to see that there exists $t_{0} \in \mathbb{N}_{1}$ such that $\left.\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right|_{t=t_{0}}=C=\frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2}$ exists, and

$$
\begin{align*}
& (t-1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{s=2}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right] \\
= & (t-1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{s=2}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}\left[\frac{\sqrt{\pi}}{2}+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right)\right]  \tag{4.6}\\
> & 0, t \in \mathbb{N}_{1}, t \geq 2
\end{align*}
$$

which shows that the condition (3.3) of Theorem 3.2 does not hold.
Example 4.2. Consider the following fractional nabla difference equation

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{3}} x(t)\right)+\frac{2 \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{4}\right) \Gamma(t)}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{3}\right)} x(t)=2 \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{4}\right), t \in \mathbb{N}_{1},  \tag{4.7}\\
\left.\nabla_{1}^{-\frac{2}{3}} x(t)\right|_{t=1}=\frac{1}{3} \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{3}\right)
\end{array}\right.
$$

Here $\alpha=\frac{1}{3}, q(t)=\frac{2 \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{4}\right) \Gamma(t)}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{3}\right)}, f(x(t))=x(t), g(t)=2 \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{4}\right)$. Obviously, there exists $t_{0} \in \mathbb{N}_{1}$ such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left(1-\frac{s-1}{t}\right) g(s)=2 \Gamma\left(\frac{1}{4}\right) \sum_{s=t_{0}+1}^{t}\left(1-\frac{s-1}{t}\right)>0 \tag{4.8}
\end{equation*}
$$

Thus, the condition (3.13) of Theorem 3.3 does not hold. In fact, using a similar way in Example 4.1, we can verify that $x(t)=t^{\frac{1}{3}}>0$ is a non-oscillatory solution of Eq. (4.7).

Example 4.3. Consider the following fractional nabla difference equation

$$
\left\{\begin{array}{l}
\nabla\left(\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right)+\frac{2 t}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{2}\right)} x(t)=(-1)^{t} e^{t}-(-1)^{t-1} e^{t-1}, t \in \mathbb{N}_{1}  \tag{4.9}\\
\left.\nabla_{1}^{-\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right|_{t=1}=c_{1}, \quad\left(c_{1} \text { is a constant }\right)
\end{array}\right.
$$

Assume that $x(t)$ is a solution of Eq. (4.9) and there exists $t_{0} \in \mathbb{N}_{1}$ such that $\left.\nabla_{1}^{\frac{1}{2}} x(t)\right|_{t=t_{0}}=C$ exists.

Here $\alpha=\frac{1}{2}, \quad q(t)=\frac{2 t}{\Gamma\left(t+\frac{1}{2}\right)} f(x(t))=x(t), g(t)=(-1)^{t} e^{t}-(-1)^{t-1} e^{t-1}$. Obviously,

$$
\begin{equation*}
\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)=(-1)^{s} e^{s}-(-1)^{t_{0}} e^{t_{0}} \tag{4.10}
\end{equation*}
$$

It is easy to see that $(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}=(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}$ is increased for $s$, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}} \leq \sqrt{\pi} \quad \text { for } s=2,3, \cdots, t \tag{4.11}
\end{equation*}
$$

Let

$$
M(t)=\sum_{s=2}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right] .
$$

It follows from (4.10) and (4.11) that $M(t)$ is oscillatory and $|M(t)|$ is a strictly monotone increasing function. Therefore, we obtain

$$
\begin{align*}
& \liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right]\right\} \\
= & \liminf _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{s=2}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}\left[C+(-1)^{s} e^{s}-(-1)^{t_{0}} e^{t_{0}}\right]\right\}  \tag{4.12}\\
= & -\infty
\end{align*}
$$

and

$$
\begin{align*}
& \limsup _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-a)^{1-\alpha} \sum_{s=a+1}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{\alpha-1}}\left[C+\sum_{\xi=t_{0}+1}^{s} g(\xi)\right]\right\} \\
= & \limsup _{t \rightarrow \infty}\left\{(t-1)^{\frac{1}{2}} \sum_{s=2}^{t}(t-s+1)^{\overline{-\frac{1}{2}}}\left[C+(-1)^{s} e^{s}-(-1)^{t_{0}} e^{t_{0}}\right]\right\}  \tag{4.13}\\
= & +\infty
\end{align*}
$$

which show that the conditions in Theorem 3.2 are satisfied. By Theorem 3.2, the solution $x(t)$ of the Eq. (4.9) is oscillatory.
Remark 4.1. Example 4.1 and Example 4.2 show that the assumptions of Theorem 3.2 and Theorem 3.3 can not be dropped, respectively.

## References

[1] F. M. Atici and P. W. Eloe, Discrete fractional calculus with the nabla operator, Electron. J. Qual. Theory Differ. Equ., Spec. Ed. I, 2009, 3, 1-12.
[2] F. M. Atici and P. W. Eloe, Initial value problems in discrete fractional calculus, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., 2009, 137, 981-989.
[3] F. M. Atici and P. W. Eloe, Gronwall's inequality on discrete fractional calculus, Comput. Math. Appl., 2012, 64, 3193-3200.
[4] F. M. Atici and P. W. Eloe, A transform method in discrete fractional calculus, Int. J. Difference Equ., 2007, 2(2), 165-176.
[5] T. Abdeljawad, On Riemann and Caputo fractional differences, Comput. Math. Appl., 2011, 62, 1602-1611.
[6] S. Abbas, M. Benchohra and G. M. N'Guérékata, Topics in Fractional Differential Equations, Springer, New York, 2012.
[7] J. O. Alzabut and T. Abdeljawad, Sufficient conditions for the oscillation of nonlinear fractional difference equations, J. Fract. Calc. Appl., 2014, 5, 177187.
[8] Z. Bai and R. Xu, The asymptotic behavior of solutions for a class of nonlinear fractional difference equations with damping term, Discrete Dynamics in Nature and Society, 2018, 2018, Article ID5232147.
[9] J. Diblík and M. Fečkan M. Pospísil, Nonexistence of periodic solutions and Sasymptotically periodic solutions in fractional difference equations, Appl. Math. Comput., 2015, 257, 230-240.
[10] L. Erbe, C. S. Goodrich and B. Jia, A. Peterson, Survey of the qualitative properties of fractional difference operators: monotonicity, convexity, and asymptotic behavior of solutions, Advances in Difference Equations, 2016(2016): 43.
[11] H. L. Gray and N. F. Zhang, On a new definition of the fractional difference, Math. Comp., 1988, 50, 513-529.
[12] C. S. Goodrich, Existence of a positive solution to a system of discrete fractional boundary value problems, Appl. Math. Comput., 2011, 217, 4740-4753.
[13] C. Goodrich and A. C. Peterson, Discrete Fractional Calculus, Springer, Berlin, 2015.
[14] S. Harikrishnan, P. Prakash and J. J. Nieto, Forced oscillation of solutions of a nonlinear fractional partial differential equation, Appl. Math. Comput., 2015, 254, 14-19.
[15] A. A. Kilbas, H. M. Srivastava and J. J. Trujillo, Theory and Applications of Fractional Differential Equations, Elsevier Science B. V, Amsterdam, 2006.
[16] H. Liu and F. Meng, Some new nonlinear integral inequalities with weakly singular kernel and their applications to FDEs, Journal of Inequalities and Applications, 2015(2015): 209.
[17] W. N. Li, On the forced oscillation of certain fractional partial differential equations, Appl. Math. Lett. 50(2015), 5-9.
[18] W. N. Li, Oscillation results for certain forced fractional difference equations with damping term, Advances in Difference Equations, 2016(2016): 70.
[19] W. N. Li and W. Sheng, Sufficient conditions for oscillation of a nonlinear fractional nabla difference system, SpringerPlus, 5(2016): 1178.
[20] W. N. Li and W. Sheng, Forced oscillation for solutions of boundary value problems of fractional partial difference equations, Advances in Difference Equations, 2016(2016): 263.
[21] K. S. Miller and B. Ross, Fractional Difference Calculus, Proceedings of the International Symposium on Univalent Functions, Fractional Calculus and Their Applications, Nihon University, Koriyama, Japan, May 1988, 139-152; Ellis Horwood Ser. Math. Appl., Horwood, Chichester, 1989.
[22] S. L. Marian, M. R. Sagayaraj, A. G. M. Selvam and M. P. Loganathan, Oscillatory behavior of forced fractional difference equations, Int. Electron. J. Pure Appl. Math., 2014, 8, 33-39.
[23] I. Podlubny, Fractional Differential Equations, Academic Press, San Diego, 1999.
[24] P. Prakash, S. Harikrishnan and M. Benchohra, Oscillation of certain nonlinear fractional partial differential equation with damping term, Appl. Math. Lett., 2015, 43, 72-79.
[25] J. Shao, Z. Zheng and F. Meng, Oscillation criteria for fractional differential equations with mixed nonlinearities, Advances in Difference Equations, 2013(2013): 323.
[26] R. Xu and F. Meng, Some new weakly singular integral inequalities and their applications to fractional differential equations, Journal of Inequalities and Applications, 2016(2016): 78.
[27] R. Xu, Some new nonlinear weakly singular integral inequalities and their applications, Journal of Mathematical Inequalities, 2017, 1007-1018.
[28] J. Yang, A. Liu and T. Liu, Forced oscillation of nonlinear fractional differential equations with damping term, Advances in Difference Equations, 2015(2015): 1.


[^0]:    ${ }^{\dagger}$ the corresponding author. Email address: wnli@263.net(W. Li)
    ${ }^{1}$ School of Science, Binzhou University, Huanghe 5th Road, Binzhou 256603, China
    *The authors were supported by the Natural Science Foundation of Shandong Province (ZR2017MA019).

